COMBATING MODERN SLAVERY: AN EXAMINATION OF LEGAL FRAMEWORKS AND ENFORCEMENT MECHANISMS ON NON-STATE ACTORS

DR. NKEM ADELEYE

It is of particular concern that despite slavery being abolished in international law with a clear international legal framework existing (ILO Conventions, Slavery Convention, Supplementary Convention and Palermo Protocols) which criminalises slave labour and human trafficking and imposes duties on state actors, these practices are condoned by both state and non-state actors. The world of sports for instance, is a lucrative industry generating a significant level of income, which sometimes exceeds states’ GDP. The FIFA world cup is the biggest sporting event that oversees countries bidding to host. The benefits to a host country include tourism, creation of jobs, accommodation and transport infrastructure. Qatar will be hosting the next world cup in 2022 and have come under intense scrutiny and criticism for abusive labour practices. Recording 185 Nepalese deaths in Qatar in 2013 while building world cup infrastructure, an estimation of the death of 4000 migrant workers before the launch of the word cup. FIFA’s mission to build a better future for all through football has been questioned while Qatar officials echoed the outrage stirred by media reports expressing shock at the deplorable conditions migrant workers have been subjected to. In collaboration with the International Labour Organisation (ILO), Qatar has agreed to oversee reform with enforcement mechanisms in place to ensure maximum protection for over 2 million migrant workers, with the ultimate aim of scrapping this exploitative system of sponsored labour.

Although Qatar has duties under international law and has to report to the United Nations and the ILO, the question is whether oversight can be exercised over international sports organisations where main actors/stakeholders such as FIFA are captured under this framework. FIFA was prompted to take action on particular issues and to take an active stance against certain abusive labour practices, which prevail in Qatar. This paper is contributng to the ever-increasing debate that in a globalised society, we need to move away from the state-centred focus of international law and move towards creating legal frameworks that capture non-state actors, creating binding obligations on them. This paper provides an insight into practices condoned by states, which create avenues for the perpetration of this transnational crime.

With a growing discourse on the emergence of modern slavery and human trafficking on the political and legislative agenda, and with human trafficking estimated to generate billions in illicit proceeds, this discussion re-ignites the debate that activities of state and non-state actors need to fall within the sphere of international law in combating modern slavery and human trafficking.

INTRODUCTION

“Slavery is not a horror consigned safely consigned to the past”

The formal abolition of slavery as the legal ownership of people was abolished in the 19th century. In spite of the great efforts by emancipators and their successors and the plethora (300) of international agreements for the suppression of slavery is still as problematic as it was in the 18th century, but now presents itself in...
a different form. It is evident that the only form of slavery, that has been eradicated, is the ‘legal formal ownership of people.”⁴ According to Bales, the challenges campaigners confront today in addressing and eradicating modern slavery is different from those faced at the origin of the abolition in 1787.⁵

It is now established that constituents of modern slavery include human trafficking, prostitution, child labour, female circumcision and relevant to this discussion - slave/forced labour. A clear definition of the forms of exploitative labour relations, which can be referred to as, is currently lacking. The Modern Slavery Act [2015] makes provision for slavery, servitude, forced/compulsory labour and human trafficking – including provisions for the protection of victims. These terms have distinct definitions and codifications as crimes under international and domestic law and are viewed as proxy categories for modern slavery.⁶ A number of instruments which have contributed to widespread prohibitions of slavery, forced labour and human trafficking practices are in force and have been ratified by several countries.⁷

A number of international Conventions which criminalise slave labour and imposes duties on state actors are in force in several states. These include International Labour Organisation Conventions, Slavery Convention (1926), The Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery (1956); and The Palermo Protocols (2000) - three Protocols adopted by the UN to supplement the 2000 Convention against Transnational Organised Crime (the Palermo Convention). With regard to the accurate terminology and nomenclature, the following words have been used synonymously with slavery – serfdom, debt, bondage, peonage, servitude, indentured servitude and primarily forced labour. According to the International Labour Organisation (ILO) “slavery is one form of forced labour”, it noted that some national laws treat the two as different instances and work on the assumption that forced labour is the least serious of these offences. The ILO estimates that about 21 million men, women and children are in forced labour around the world – trafficked, held in debt bondage or working in slavery-like conditions. Ninety per cent of these are exploited in the private economy, and almost half of all victims have migrated internally or across borders. Forced labour generates an estimated US$150 billion in illicit profits, causing industries and businesses to face unfair competition and States to lose billions in tax income and social security contributions.⁸

The soccer governing body FIFA (The Fédération Internationale de Football Association) is a lucrative organisation with its income exceeding states GDP. The FIFA world cup is the biggest sporting event that oversees countries bidding to host. The benefits to a host country include tourism, creation of jobs, accommodation and transport infrastructure. Amidst a somewhat controversial and contentious win,⁹ Qatar will be hosting the next world cup in 2022 and it plans to build a brand new city in its desert, ultra-modern stadium with unparalleled solar technology to cool stadiums and up to 86,000 fans.¹⁰ With a population of

---

⁷ Other Conventions which prohibit slavery, forced labour and other forms of modern slavery include the UN Slavery Convention of 1926, the Supplementary Convention on the Abolition of Slavery, the Slave Trade, and Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery of 1956 and the UN Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, especially women and children
¹⁰ Strutner, S. (2014 25 August). Qatar’s new World Cup city is a modern marvel. The Huffington Post, [https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/08/25/qatars-new-world-cup-city_n_5698138.html](https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/08/25/qatars-new-world-cup-city_n_5698138.html). See also, Erfani,
less than 2 million people, it will have to rely on about 1 million foreign labourers to build the stadium. While Qatari nationals are encouraged to increase their contribution to the work force, the labour laws in the country give Qatari employers substantial control over foreign employees known as kafeel.11 Under this system, a worker cannot change jobs, leave the country, get a drivers licence rent a home, or open a back account without the permission of the employer sponsor. The employees are under the employer sponsorship system of kafala that binds a foreign worker to their employer.12 They cannot leave the country without the employers consent and can be left without pay for over 2 years.

Qatar is a party to the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and the ILO Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention. Under both treaties, Qatar is under an obligation to eliminate discrimination, defined under the ILO as “any distinction, exclusion or preference made on the basis of race, colour, sex, religion political opinion, national extraction or social origin, which has the effect of nullifying or impairing equality or treatment in employment or occupation.”13 Qatar also has domestic laws in place, which protect the fundamental rights of workers.14 The Labour Law, and a set of related decrees, sets out workers’ rights in Qatari law, including limits on working hours, mandated annual leave, living conditions, health and safety and the requirement for salaries to be paid on time. The Ministry of Labour is responsible for overseeing the Labour Law’s implementation and under the nations Labour laws, migrant workers are prohibited from joining and forming trade unions, which is a universal human right.

The central theme of this paper is around the subject of modern slavery and human trafficking. States have obligations under international law, which are in place to combat and eradicate this ill. The international community have measures in place to ensure adherence to international human rights norms but these measures do not extend fully to conditions, which involve non-state actors. The inaction and passive stance of these new actors is exacerbating. In this paper, I discuss the conditions migrant workers are exposed to in Qatar, using FIFA and as focal point in addressing the possibility of creating binding obligations as participants in the combat against modern slavery and human trafficking.

LITERATURE REVIEW

QATAR 2022

“How can we play in a stadium that is built with blood” [Abdeslam Ouaddou]15


13 Article 1(a), Discrimination (Employment and Occupation) Convention.

14 Some of these laws include, Law no. 14 of 2004 (“the Labour Law”) and the Ministerial decrees related to this law, Law no. 4 of 2009 (“the Sponsorship Law”), Law no. 10 of 2010 (regarding workers’ accommodation) and Law no. 15 of 2011 (“the Human Trafficking Law”).

15 Abdeslam Ouaddou a former Morocco defender brought a case before FIFA’s Dispute Resolution Chamber against a Qatari club for failing to pay him for six months and breached his right to freedom of movement. Qatar SC withheld his exit visa. The DRC ruled in his favour and ordered the club to pay him everything they owed him. See, BBC Sport, (2014, 13 February) Morroco’s Abdeslam Ouaddou wins case against Qatari club, [https://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/26169879](https://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/26169879)
Human trafficking has been estimated to generate more than 150 billion in illicit proceeds each year.\textsuperscript{16} Human Trafficking is ranked among the top three most lucrative businesses after drug trafficking and counterfeiting by the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (UNODC). The term ‘modern slavery’ has been linked to discussions ranging from prostitution, child labour, illegal prostitution, female circumcision and organ trading, human trafficking, and now with employment rights and employment relations. Siller (2016) identifies the need for clarification of these terms as crimes under international law. It is now established that the constituents of modern slavery include ownership of people, exploitation of the vulnerable, terms and conditions of employment, denial of rights outside the work relationship. There is lacking a clear definition of what forms of exploitative labour relations can be regarded as slavery. Recent reports of slave labour reveal the inhuman and degrading treatment experienced by workers. A 2016 report by Associated Press revealed workers in Asia in the seafood industry were forced to work 20-22 hours a day. They were locked up in a room, ate few spoonful’s of rice and drank little water. They had no contact with their families. This report led to rescue of 2000 slaves.\textsuperscript{17} In 2017, the Markowski brothers were convicted for arranging the travel for labour exploitation of men from Poland. They were recruited to work for Sports Direct warehouse in the UK. The brothers employed someone from Poland to employ vulnerable people they could exercise control over. When they arrived the UK their passports were taken off them, they were isolated and kept in appalling living conditions. They were convicted and sentenced to six years in prison for modern slavery offences. The presiding judge, Judge Coupland stated “this was a planned and systematic instance of human trafficking.”\textsuperscript{18}

In a 2013 publication by The Guardian newspaper, the treatment of the migrant workers exposed to exploitation and abuses, which amount to modern day slavery, was exposed.\textsuperscript{19} The investigative report revealed Nepalese workers died at a rate of one a day in Qatar, most of them were young men who had died from sudden heart attacks.\textsuperscript{20} According to documents obtained from the Nepalese embassy in Doha, around 44 workers who had died within a three-month period, died from heart attacks or workplace accidents. Their investigation further revealed evidence of forced labour, workers’ passports routinely confiscated, refusal to issue ID cards thereby reducing them to illegal immigrants, failure to pay wages for months to prevent workers from leaving, workers made to work long hours in temperatures of up to 50C and access to free drinking water in the desert heat denied.\textsuperscript{21}

Some of these workers were indeed trafficked from Nepal, Indonesia and Bangladesh on a false pretext that a lucrative job awaits them when they arrive Doha. They arrive Qatar to find these promises to be contrary. These workers are paid less than half of what they were promised as income and instead of clerical jobs,\textsuperscript{22} they are introduced to work on a construction site in the desert heat.\textsuperscript{23} They also discover that they are

\textsuperscript{17} Associated Press (2016). An AP investigation helps frees slaves in the 21\textsuperscript{st} century. https://www.ap.org/explore/seafood-from-slaves/
\textsuperscript{21} Id.
\textsuperscript{23} Supra.
indebted to their employers through a recruitment fee, a part of the contract of employment, which is the equivalent of 2 years’ worth of wages. These workers become enslaved even before commencing their jobs. One hundred and eighty five Nepalese deaths were recorded in Qatar in 2013 while building World Cup infrastructure. The International Trade Union Confederation estimates that an additional 4,000 workers could die before launch of World Cup in 2022 if the workforce grows as expected. This is considerably high compared to the preparation of the 2014 World Cup in Brazil where a death toll of eight workers was recorded weeks before the opening March. The Nepalese ambassador to Qatar, Maya Kumari Sharma described the emirate as an “open jail”. Human Rights Watch in 2017 issues a report where it highlighted the poor living and working conditions of workers in Qatar. Regulations which were meant to protect workers from heat and humidity were still inadequate with hundreds of migrant workers dropping dead on construction projects each year. A UN delegation who visited Qatar to investigate the working conditions in place were informed by a Nepalese worker that conditions had not improved. The worker was summarily dismissed, sent back to Nepal and imprisoned for not having a sponsor, due to his summary dismissal. Qatar have come under intense scrutiny and criticism for these abusive labour practices. This system applies to all foreign employers from professional employers to low income earners. While the highly skilled can afford the services of legal practitioners, others cannot. Abdelslam Ouaddou’s exit visa was withheld from him and he was told he would receive his permission to leave Qatar only if he withdrew his complaint. To FIFA. He expresses his displeasure at the prospect of Qatar hosting the World Cup, a country he believes “does not respect Human Rights” and does not respect the rights of workers.” A French footballer, Zahir Belounis suffered a similar fate when his contract was terminated after he was appointed captain of a Qatari team El Jaish. Belounis brought legal action against the club for leaving him without pay, the club responded by denying his exit visa, which means he cannot leave the country unless his ex-employer permits him to and he was left without income for two years. In his letter to the Guardian, Belounis spoke about feeling ‘trapped’ as a result of the kafala system, which he appealed needed to be scrapped for the sake of migrant workers in the country.

---

24 Liew, J. (2017, October 3). World Cup 2022: Qatar’s workers are not workers, they are slaves, and they are building mausoleums, not stadiums. The Independent. https://www.independent.co.uk/sport/football/international/world-cup-2022-qatars-workers-slaves-building-mausoleums-stadiums-modern-slavery-kafala-a7980816.html
27 Liew, J. (2017, October 3). World Cup 2022: Qatar’s workers are not workers, they are slaves, and they are building mausoleums, not stadiums. https://www.independent.co.uk/sport/football/international/world-cup-2022-qatars-workers-slaves-building-mausoleums-stadiums-modern-slavery-kafala-a7980816.html
28 Id.
31 Supra, at 29.
The Kafala (sponsorship) system is commonly practiced in all six Middle Eastern countries of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC). Fifty percent of the total population of Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) are classified as migrants, the UAE being the “most extreme” with foreigners constituting 80% of the total population. Under this system, every migrant worker must have a sponsor who must also be his/her employer. An employer could be a company registered in Qatar and in the case of domestic staff, an individual. Migrant workers cannot change jobs without the permission of their sponsor. This permission is sometimes called an "NOC" (no objection certificate). If workers leave their sponsor without permission, they are considered to have “absconded” - a criminal offence - and their sponsors are required to report them to the Search and Follow-up Department (sometimes called "CID" by migrant workers) of the Ministry of Interior, which polices the Sponsorship Law. Workers who "abscond" are likely to face detention and deportation. Migrant workers are forbidden to leave the country without their employer’s permission; they must obtain an exit permit with the approval of their employer before being cleared by immigration to leave the country. The employers (sponsors) are required by law to return the workers passport at the end of their employment. They also have the responsibility to arrange with the authorities for workers to be issued residence permits to demonstrate their right to work in Qatar which also grants the access to basic services. Workers are fined for not having these permits and these fines must be paid before leaving the country. Employers are responsible for providing accommodation for migrant workers in accordance with local regulations but this is done without close monitoring by the states to ensure adherence to these standards.

Qatar is unique in that it hosts more migrants than the rest of the world. Qatar’s labour force has been described as largely dominated by migrant workers, making Qatar the world’s highest ratio of immigrants to citizens. The sponsorship system is policed by the Ministry of the Interior and set out in Law No. 4 of 2009 (the “Sponsorship Law”). A 2013 report by Amnesty International on Qatar’s Construction Sector deeply criticised the nation’s use of this sponsorship system. This system has been criticised as a recipe for “exploitation and forced labour.” The increased dependency of the migrant workers on their sponsors renders them vulnerable and exposes them to various forms of exploitation and abuses.

**Qatar’s Response**

Qatar’s response was immediate. It expressed shock at the deplorable conditions migrant workers were exposed to. Qatar officials echoed the outrage stirred by media report and promised a thorough investigation and improvements. In addition, Qatar acknowledged its obligation under the ILO Convention to play a central role in the analysis of enforcement mechanisms available to increase protections for migrant workers. The Qatar 2022 Supreme Committee, the organisation responsible for organising the World Cup expressed “deep concerns” about the allegations levelled against the contractors on site and declared that

---

32 The Gulf Cooperation Council is the political and economic alliance of six Middle Eastern countries – Saudi Arabia, Kuwait, United arab Emirates, Qatar, Bahrain and Oman.
the government are carrying out their own investigations about the matter. The Supreme Committee allocated resources to alleviate the condition of workers by making available a hotline where migrant workers could report abuses. The Committee gave assurances that decent labour standards will be in place for the World Cup in 2022. Furthermore, the Doha government responded positively with a commitment to scrap this exploitative system of sponsored labour, which effectively means getting rid of the kafala system, which affects 23 million migrant workers across Middle East, some of whom are trapped in slave like conditions. Following an inquiry by the ILO in 2014, Qatar agreed to introduce labour reforms such as minimum wage, lodging of contracts with government so that they cannot be changed upon arrival and employers are no longer able to prevent staff from leaving if they choose to. Qatar also pledged to build accommodation units for 340,000 workers and to commence elimination of exit visas. In collaboration with the ILO, the Qatar government agreed that these reforms will be overseen by the ILO office in Doha and for the Labour Tribunal to oversee disputes within three weeks.

FIFA’s Role Reviewed

The International Trade Union Confederation were expressive about these concerns, and they were adamant that a demand for change from FIFA - abolishment of the kafala system and respect fundamental human rights – would lead to extensive reform. FIFA has been prompted to take action on local labour issues in the past. They took an active stance against child labour in the production of soccer balls in the past. Similar to the labour issues in Qatar, media outlets acted as a catalyst for reform and awareness. FIFA worked in collaboration with ILO, trade unions and NGO’s in the “Elimination of Child Labour in the Soccer Ball Industry,” reinforcing its mission to “build better future for all through football,” FIFA stated that it will closely monitor the working conditions in Qatar. Another prompt on FIFA to reflect on its own vulnerability may push the organisation to take stronger measures against abusive labour practices in Qatar and in future World Cup host countries. FIFA can play an active role in reinforcing labour protections for workers by setting clear expectations from the start that it will collaborate with local and international unions.

Amnesty International called on FIFA to address the issue of migrant workers’ abuse in Qatar, expressing outrage after FIFA’s Secretary General at the time, Jerome Valcke replied to Amnesty’s call by saying that “FIFA is not a United Nations. FIFA is about sport.” Amnesty reiterated the fact that FIFA assumed responsibility for the human rights violations, which have resulted from its decision to allow Qatar host the event. FIFA’s past President Sepp Blatter, agreed that the organisation did bear “some responsibility” for the deplorable working conditions but it could not interfere in the rights of workers. A position which I strongly disagree with and will address below in my discussion in this paper. Blatter’s position that the responsibility of the violation of fundamental rights lies first with Qatar and the companies employing the workers is inaccurate. FIFA could be proactive rather than reactive by being a catalyst to enforce existing


ILO conventions/promote labour law reform when the image of labour is at stake. The disregard for workers’ rights goes beyond the preparation for the World Cup and extends to other labour in general in the country.

**DISCUSSION**

**Capturing “Non-state actors” in International Law**

New actors other than states are emerging on the international scene, which means structurally, we are witnessing an ongoing and gradual ‘verticalization’ of power. FIFA was established in 1904 under Swiss Law, as an organisation is endowed with powers to govern and regulate world football. This governance extends to authority over social and economic dimensions of the industry. With its headquarters in Switzerland, FIFA oversees over 209 national football associations, which all belong to one of six regional confederations. FIFA’s administration is made up of FIFA Congress (representatives of all national member associations, who are in charge of its governing statutes and method of implementation), the Executive and Standing Committees. Garrett (2018) suggests that FIFA’s governance structure encourages its illegal behaviour arising from the difficulty of legal categorisation and clarity of conduct standards. This absence of a form of legal categorisation makes it difficult to regulate FIFA. In effect how do we legally categorize FIFA and how do we define its conduct standards.\(^{42}\) It is difficult to contend with the opinion and statement of fact that FIFA’s unique governance structure makes it vulnerable to criticism and encourages its illegal behaviour. In the last 25 years FIFA has been criticised for bribery, racketeering, money laundering and wire fraud, spanning through the 1998 world cup, Presidential election, the 2020 World Cup, and alleged vote buying regarding the location of the 2018 and 2022 World Cup respectively. There has also been criticisms that the lack of financial integrity in the form of corruption and bribery poses a risk of human rights abuse and a diversion of funds intended for social gain.\(^{43}\)

FIFA was criticised for awarding the 2022 World Cup to Qatar, a country with unfavourable human rights record and little national soccer history/ and infrastructure brought about workers’ rights abuses, leading to modern slavery and death. Qatar, on the other hand, has a poor record of workers’ rights and safety. As noted earlier, these reports revealed poor working conditions, forced labour in unhealthy temperatures and non-payment or delay of wages. These issues have raised awareness and a demand for accountability. FIFA has been criticised for its suppression of national power in its legal interventions by imposing its rules on countries within its associations, giving it a certain degree of immunity from any potential source of accountability. There has been positive responses and reaction on the part of FIFA - in 2016, FIFA enacted reforms to its governance structure and enshrined new commitment to human rights, which was lacking prior to 2016. FIFA can be conceptualised as a private corporation – a potent corporate entity – a big business or a public governance regime due to its role as Head of international soccer regime. The reality is that FIFA sees itself as a government more than a private corporation, especially as it describes itself as “truly democratic,” which is apparent from its structure with its executive, legislative and judicial bodies. This leads us to the question of accountability where their main business partners are corporate sponsors and television companies whose interests are primarily economic. Garret suggests a combination of private and public sector regulatory measures since they are an organisation of public interest.

**The Current Position under International Law**

Public International law is now considering the rights and obligations of non-state actors moving away from the status quo in which the system of international law is based on nation states. For decades, the international legal system has been dominated by states. While this position is descriptively accurate, taking note of the history and development of International Law and the fundamental role played by states, it is in

---

\(^{42}\) Garrett, C. (2018). Has FIFA outgrown its international immunity?  
\(^{43}\) Supra.
itself has been described as “normatively problematic”.\textsuperscript{44} Especially where states have proved unable to assume the roles of protection of individuals under their formal jurisdiction. One of the chief aims of international law is to protect individuals from the arbitrary interference by the state as well as facilitating the action of citizens calling the state to account for breaches of human rights. Since individuals are always in a territorial space their interests and needs are best represented by the sovereign state where they abide.

International law defines a state as possessing territory and having sovereignty over it\textsuperscript{45} but it should not preclude a critical inquiry as to why territorial states have come to be considered as the main containers of political authority. Political authority is usually confined to the physical territorial presence of individuals – which is political authority in a space called the state. It is possible to conceive political authority in a space beyond the state.

Recent events such as the one highlighted in Qatar, shows that the states are not the only relevant actors that can have a legitimate representative function. States are not the only containers of political authority. Some examples of this new category of actors (non-state actors) in international law include International Governmental Organisations, Multinational Organisations, Investors and armed opposition groups. Some multinationals have resisted the imposition of direct human rights obligations in the past on the grounds that human rights have been conceived for vertical relationships of authority between government and an individual rather than for horizontal relationships between non-state actors. Evidently, it is pertinent that an examination of the roles and participation of non-state actors in international law must be conducted. Non-state actors should have concrete rights and obligations under international law to direct the legal interaction and relationships between state and non-state actors, and between non-state actors themselves. My position is that corporations like FIFA should be encumbered with direct human rights obligations and tier participatory rights should be legitimately enhanced.

How the can international law impose on FIFA as a non-state actor, a legislative space since it has influence within states to the degree that individual rights can be exploited as long as their relational status is based on FIFA’s own rules? How do we create binding obligations on non-state actors?

CONCLUSION

Creating a Legislative Space for Non-state Actors

Ryngeart (2017) opines that, “the non-democratic, autocratic states may serve as proof thereof, but more fundamentally, from a historical perspective, the very rise of the territorial state in the early modern period points to the existence of prior, alternative forms of regulation that could be non-territorial or non-state based.” Political authority is normally confined to the physical territorial presence of individuals – which is political authority in a space called the state.

By Ryngeart’s assertion is possible to conceive political authority in a space beyond the state. This is relevant to organisations like FIFA who pledge to “build a better world through football.” The recurring violations cannot be overlooked because it emanates from a state with sovereign power. Considering the sphere it controls, FIFA can take a stronger stand against such practices by enforcing regulations and rules for nations hosting World Cups. A modern slavery statement from these countries pledging to protect the rights of migrant workers in their countries ought to be in place and enforced by FIFA; and endorsed by international law. Modern slavery is an ill which cannot be ignored by states and organisations alike. A

\textsuperscript{44} Ryngeart, C. (2017) non-state actors in International law: A rejoinder to Professor Thirlway. \textit{Netherlands International Law Review} 64, pp 115-162.
\textsuperscript{45} Evans, M.D. (2018) International law. Oxford University Press. 5\textsuperscript{th} ed.
strong statement forbidden such practices should be proclaimed and non-state actors should be imposed with binding obligations for the preservation of human dignity.

REFERENCES


BBC Sport, (2014, 13 February) Morroco’s Abdeslam Ouaddou wins case against Qatari club, [https://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/26169879](https://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/26169879)


Dave Jamieson. Huffington Post (2014, March 21), Migrant workers in World Cup host Qatar ‘enslaved’ living in squalor: Report. [https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/qatar-migrant-workers_n_5009105?guccounter=1&guce_referrer_us=aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuZ29vZ2xlLmNvbS8&guce_referrer_cs=s1mGeJAGYV74sfOK5YrpWw](https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/entry/qatar-migrant-workers_n_5009105?guccounter=1&guce_referrer_us=aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuZ29vZ2xlLmNvbS8&guce_referrer_cs=s1mGeJAGYV74sfOK5YrpWw)


Garrett, C. (2018). Has FIFA outgrown its international immunity?


Liew, J. (2017, October 3). World Cup 2022: Qatar’s workers are not workers, they are slaves, and they are building mausoleums, not stadiums. [Link](https://www.independent.co.uk/sport/football/international/world-cup-2022-qatars-workers-slaves-building-mausoleums-stadiums-modern-slavery-kafala-a7980816.html)


Struutner, S. (2014, 25 August). Qatar’s new World Cup city is a modern marvel. The Huffington Post. [Link](https://www.huffingtonpost.co.uk/2014/08/25/qatars-new-world-cup-city_n_5698138.html). See also, Erfani,


A Comparison between Constructivist and Traditional Approach for Teaching Grammar to ESL

Maria Sajid
University of Management and Technology

Abstract
With the growing importance and need of English language, it is imperative to improve the quality of English teaching; especially, in Pakistan where English teachers and learners face immense problems and often follow the traditional approach for language teaching. For teaching English, constructivism has been developed as a substantial approach, which is a shift from education based on traditional approach, to education based on cognitive theory. This experimental study intends to compare the effectiveness of constructivist and traditional approach for teaching English grammar at undergraduate level. Pre-test and post-tests are used through SPSS to determine the proficiency level of the participants before and after the intervention. To triangulate the study participants were selected for interview, through purposive sampling. The results show some improvement in both the groups but the degree of achievement of the experimental group is higher than that of the control group. This study suggests that “Teachers Training” and “Curriculum Development” ought to adopt the contemporary approach. Like all other genres of English language grammar needs to be explored under constructivism.

Key words: Constructivism, Traditional Approach, Grammar teaching (Prepositions)

Introduction

English is considered the most frequently used language in the world (Hinkel, 2003) and is therefore crucial to communication around the globe. All communication and publication is done in English as it beat all languages (UNESCO, 2009). It had gained the status of the official language in Pakistan at the time of independence.

Teaching and learning of English language is essential by all means especially at university level where it is the language of education. The educationists have a serious concern about English language teaching which is not satisfactory in the region. A number of students from rural, and even urban, areas in Pakistan find it difficult to communicate in English language (Warsi, 2007).

In Pakistan, number of teachers believe and follow the conventional method of teaching English language, which seems a barrier in acquiring proficiency in language (Aslam, et al. 2010; Behlol & Anwar, 2011; Shamim, 2008). Students face difficulties in learning grammar in English language classes (Ahmad et al. 2011). Grammar teaching has its own place that cannot be denied (Anani, 2017). Considering grammar as an essential part of language learning, a question arises about teaching grammar explicitly or implicitly. Burges and Etherington (2002) support explicit grammar teaching and consider it more effective for developing grammar competence in language learners.

Adding to this, Lightbown and Spada (2000) suggest a variety of teaching methods for English grammar to achieve the target of language proficiency. Warsi (2007) describes the traditional approach as a popular method for teaching English in Pakistan, while other learning strategies are rarely considered. However, traditional approach was the popular and a successful approach in the 19th century in Europe and many nonnative countries like Pakistan are still following it (Warsi, 2004). Lightbown and Spada (2000) highlight the following aspects of traditional approach for teaching grammar in English language:

a. Focused instructions
b. Teacher oriented strategies
c. Controlled classroom environment
d. Presentation of information
e. Memory based learning phenomenon

Constructivism is an emerging approach in the field of education. Sharma (2016) explicates constructivism as an opportunity to the learner to construct their knowledge through an active mental process. The focus of constructivism is on all modules of language competencies like grammar, discourse,
Aim of the Study

The current research focuses on teaching methodologies for grammar learning at undergraduate level. In this study, the effectiveness of the traditional approach will be compared with the effectiveness of the strategies based on constructivism. The focus will be on teaching prepositions: in, on, at by using both of the methods.

Research Questions

How does constructivism compare with traditional approach for teaching prepositions to the learners of English as a second language at university level?

Significance of the Study

The current study is based on Pakistani context that will be supportive for the teachers and researchers for English language teaching and learning. Results of the study may motivate the English language teachers to consider new methods while teaching English grammar to their students. Moreover, the results of this study may highlight few benefits for curriculum designers in teaching grammar for English language learning.

Literature Review

Importance of English in developing countries like Pakistan cannot be undermined. English language is an official language in Pakistan. Elite and cadet schools of Pakistan use the language as a medium of instruction (Rahman, 2001). The students from the government institutions are usually left behind due to poor language skills in English (Mahmood, 2007). Thus, the importance of English language in Pakistanis intensely felt as it prepares students for higher education and then for jobs to excel in life.

The role of grammar in teaching English as Second Language

In language teaching, grammar is usually taught by informing the learners about the rules and practical implementation of grammar is commonly known as sentence patterns (Gokhale, 2010). During the process of grammar teaching, grammatical items and sentence patterns must be focused. Language competence is the underlying knowledge of linguistic features (grammar) (Chomsky, 1965).

Traditional Methods

According to Rivers (1981) traditional methods of teaching were Grammar Translation Method, Direct Method and Audio Lingual method. From 19th century to the mid of 20th century these methods had widespread use and had strong credibility for teaching and learning English as a second language. In the traditional class room, the teacher has complete autonomy and the student is a passive learner. The traditional classroom often looks like a one-person show with usually uninvolved learner. In this method, a prescribed set of rules are used to teach grammar (Schuster, 2003). Standard rules, practice exercises and memorization are the assets of traditional method for grammar teaching (Schuster, 2003).

Constructivism

Scholars and philosophers such as Dewey (1916), Piaget (1973) and Vygotsky (1978) presented different perspectives and beliefs on constructivism. Piaget (1973) elaborated constructivism as addition of knowledge by knowing the world and students gain this knowledge in different stages. According to
Vygotsky (1978), students develop socially first and then at the individual level and he called it social constructivism. According to Glaserfeld (1995), constructivism assumed that knowledge already exists in minds, therefore learning will be processed on the basis of what they already know due to their experiences. With all the above-mentioned views, constructivism is considered the theory of learning in which “learning is an active process” and “consists of constructing conceptual relationships and meaning from information and experiences already in the learner’s repertoire” (Cooper, 2009).

**Constructivism in Education.**

Constructivism cannot be ignored in the field of education as it guides important implications for teaching (Hoover, 1996). Based on this approach, teacher’s duty is not only to transmit the knowledge to the unenlightened, but also to act like “guide on the side” instead of playing the role of the “sage on the stage”. A general misconception of constructivism is that it dismisses the active role of the teacher, who is the expert of knowledge in that learning environment. In fact, constructivism modifies the role of a teacher, who helps the learner to build his own knowledge rather than reproduce the series of facts (Prawl, 1999).

**A Contrastive Analysis of Constructivism and Traditional Method of Teaching**

Several studies presented that constructivist way of teaching English is better when compared with the traditional approach. For instance, Al Muhaimeed (2013) found that using a constructivist technique helped students in schools in Saudi Arabia increase reading comprehension more than that of the traditional teaching method of the English language. Nikitina (2010) also found noticeable evidence that when the students were allowed to do constructivist activities such as using visuals and preparing a video project with teamwork, they learned a foreign language better. In another study, conducted in a public school in India, Sengupta (2015) showed that by engaging the students with the collaborative writing task they made noticeable progress. A qualitative study was conducted by Altun and Büyükduman (2007) in Turkey. Students of this study mentioned that sharing examples during class enhanced their learning.

Yang (2002) conducted a qualitative study in which he found that new knowledge of one subject can be built while reinforcing previous knowledge from another subject. He established through his study that English language learners need to be approached with a variety of constructivist techniques for optimal learning and a positive learning experience.

Similarly, a quasi-experimental study was conducted by Gundogdu (2010) in Turkey. The control group was taught through traditional and experimental group was taught through constructivist strategies. Experimental group showed significant improvement. In fact, repeated research has found that teacher centered lessons can be less or non-productive, and in some cases, detrimental to the students’ learning process (Zoller, 2000). Furthermore, many teachers are hesitant to try the constructivist model, because it requires additional planning and a relaxation of the traditional rules of the classroom (Scheurman, 1998).

**Methodology**

The current research is an experimental study under the positivist paradigm. According to the positivist paradigm “truth is established by looking at the hard facts” (Higg & Smith, 2006). To achieve the aim, true experimental study is considered the appropriate way for this research. Two groups - control and experimental were made with the former being taught through the traditional approach and the latter experiencing the intervention i.e. being taught through the constructivist approach.

Triangulation by method was applied for the current study to produce valid, rich and substantiated results. In this triangulation, more than one method was used from single source to gather data (Bryman, 2003: 1142). Three participants from each group were selected who showed noticeable difference in their pre-test and post-test.
Sampling Procedure

Quantitative Sampling.

The participants for the current study were selected from the enrolment list using simple random sampling through the MS Excel random function. A sample of 20 participants (n=20) was selected for the current study.

Qualitative Sampling.

The participants were purposively selected for one to one interview from the experimental and control group. Three participants from each group with significant difference of marks in pre-test and post-test were selected purposively for interviews.

Instruments

Pre-test.

The pretest (Appendix A) was designed to measure the existing knowledge of prepositions of the participants for the experimental study. A pretest provides a measure on some skills through which participants are assessed before any experimental study or treatment (Creswell, 2007).

Post-test

To measure the learning as a result of the experiment, a post test (Appendix B) was adapted from the test available at Owl Purdue.

Interviews

A semi structured one on one interview (Appendix C) was conducted from six participants with three participants from each group. Eight questions were designed for this interview to obtain their views about their learning during these sessions.

Procedure

The participants of the study took the pre-test and after the intervention the post-test. After pre-test the participants were divided in two groups: control and experimental. The control group was taught through traditional approach for learning English grammar while the experimental group learnt grammar through constructivism. Lessons were planned to teach prepositions. Both groups were taught for 16 hours in 8 sessions with each session of 2 hours. At the end of the eighth session, the participants of both the groups completed the post-test that was designed to assess the improvement in the use of preposition in, on and at.

Experimental Group.

The prepositions were taught for the eight sessions. The objective of the sessions was to introduce the prepositions. Students completed sentences with the given prepositions: in, on, at and described those prepositions in the feedback session. In these sessions the prepositions in, on and at were taught under spatial, temporal and abstract domain. In the last section of the lessons students practiced the taught concepts by completing the work sheets.

Control Group.

Like experimental group, eight sessions were planned for the control group as well. Each session was of one hour and handouts were designed to facilitate the learning process. In these sessions,
prepositions were introduced generally and then individuals practiced to be clear about the basic use and concept of it. Prepositions *in, on and at* were taught under spatial, temporal and abstract domain.

**Interviews.** To inquire about the learning experience of the participants’ one on one interviews were conducted. The main purpose of the qualitative method is to focus in depth on purposefully selected small samples (Patton, 2002). During the interview, questions were rephrased if a participant could not comprehend them. These interviews were audiotaped to transcribe and analyze.

**Quantitative Validity**

Validity assesses how well an instrument measures what it has to measure (Creswell, 2007). In order to assure the accuracy of the instrument, content validity was conducted. The tests of the study were kept in mind while developing the instrument. It was ensured that each test item tested what it aimed to test. The level of difficulty of pre-test and post-test was considered along with other aspects of grammar that were part of the study. Pattern of pre-test was followed for the post-test.

**Qualitative Validity**

In the qualitative method, validity is the degree to measure the accuracy and credibility of the information (Creswell, 2007). Many techniques were applied in the study for qualitative validation. All of the questions were related to the sessions conducted for grammar teaching. Transcriptions of interviews were shared with the participants for the review and their approval was acquired regarding the content of interview transcription as advised by Glesne and Peshkin, (1992).

Qualitative data was collected vigilantly to avoid any misconception. Although, the asked questions and answers were not complex even then the persistent data was collected through recording. Participant’s trust was built before interview to collect original feedback of the sessions conducted for grammar teaching and gathered information in interviews was checked thoroughly.

**Data Analysis**

To analyze the quantitative data, SPSS 20 statistical software was used. A statistical test on quantitative data is an authentic source for data analysis (Gravetter & Wallnau, 2007: p. 564. Independent sample t-test was applied to compare pre-test of both groups and post-test of both groups. The result with no significant difference in this test declares the study is clear from biasedness. Paired sample t-test was applied to compare the scores of pre-test and post-test of traditional group and constructivist group. For qualitative analysis the interviews were recorded first and then transcribed. Answers of the participants were placed under themes to analyze the data.

**Limitation of Study**

This study was conducted carefully but few limitations exist. First of all, the time period was only 16 hours that is not enough for the researcher to implement methods and obtain results that can be generalized. Secondly, students were not serious in classes as they knew it was not part of their routine studies. Grammar sessions for the study were conducted in summer vacations, and students were not active as compared to routine classes.

**Results and Findings**

The current experimental study was conducted to see the effectiveness of constructivism for teaching grammar as opposed to traditional approach. Descriptive statistics of each item are presented to have a clear picture of the test. Independent sample t-test was conducted to see the difference between traditional group and constructivist group on pre-test scores, post-test scores. Paired samples t-test was applied to compare...
pre-test and post-test scores of traditional group and constructivist group. The following table presents the percentage of correct items in the pre-test and post-test.

Table 4.1

Prepositions: Percentage of Correct Answers of Each Item in Pre-Test and Post-Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Traditional</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Constructivist</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-test</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Post-test</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>Percent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4.1 presents the percentage of correct items based on prepositions in pre-test and post-test. The given data indicate that students of each group improved their skills in using prepositions. A significant difference is visible in the pre-test and post-test scores.

Table 4.2

Preposition Question 2: Percentage of Correct Answers of Each Item in Pre-Test and Post-Test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Traditional</th>
<th>Constructivist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-test</td>
<td>Post-test</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correct</td>
<td>Percent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>6 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>2 20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>6 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>5 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>6 60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>3 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>4 40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.2 shows the difference between pre-test and post-test scores of traditional and constructivist group in the correct use of preposition. Completing a sentence with a preposition and with a phrase was the second part of pre-test and post-test. The table shows that the students of each group scored higher in post-test as compared to the pre-test for this particular section.

Table 4.3

Comparison of traditional and constructivist groups on pre-test scores
Table 4.3 shows the comparison of traditional and constructivist group on pre-test. Independent samples t-test was applied to compare traditional and constructivist groups on the use of prepositions of the pre-test. There was no significant difference (p>.05) between traditional and constructivist groups on prepositions of pre-test scores. Both groups were the same on the basis of overall performance.

![Bar chart showing pre-test scores for traditional and constructivist groups]

**Figure 4.2: Comparison of pre-test scores of control group and experimental group**

Table 4.5

**Comparison of traditional and constructivist groups on post test scores**
Table 4.5 is showing the comparison between traditional and constructivist group for the post-test. Independent samples t-test was conducted to compare traditional and constructivist groups on prepositions of post-test. There was a significant difference (p<.05) between traditional and constructivist groups on the scores of post-test. Mean score (Mean=7.17, SD=1.315) of traditional group (control group) is lower as compared to the constructivist group (experimental group) (Mean=8.03, SD=1.474).

![Figure 4.2: Comparison of post-test scores of control group and experimental group](image)

**Table 4.6**

*Comparison of pre-and post-test scores of control group (traditional)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepositions</th>
<th>Pre test</th>
<th>Post test</th>
<th>Paired samples t-test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepositions</td>
<td>5.30</td>
<td>1.803</td>
<td>7.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

23
The table shows the difference in scores students gained before and after attending the grammar sessions for prepositions. Paired samples t-test was conducted to compare pre-test and Post-test scores of traditional group. There is a significant difference (P<.05) between pre-test and post-test scores. The mean score of pre-test (Mean=5.30, SD=1.803) is lower than mean score of post-test (Mean=7.03, SD=1.426). Results reveal that there is a significant difference in the use of prepositions in pre-test and post-test of traditional group.

Figure 4.3: Comparison of pre-test and post-test scores of control group

Table 4.7

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Prepositions</th>
<th>Pre test</th>
<th>Post test</th>
<th>Paired samples t-test</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepositions</td>
<td>5.47</td>
<td>2.030</td>
<td>8.03</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4.7 is showing the comparison of pre-test and post-test of experimental. Paired samples t-test was applied to compare the pre-test and post-test scores of constructivist group. The mean score of pre-test (Mean=5.47, SD=2.030) is lower than mean score of Post-test (Mean=8.03, SD=1.474). Results reveal that
there is a significant difference in the use of prepositions after the intervention and total scores on pre-test and post-test of constructivist group.

![Comparison of pre-test and post-test scores of experimental group](image)

*Figure 4.4: Comparison of pre-test and post-test scores of experimental group*

Pre-test of each group was compared through independent sample t-test, to analyze the competency of the students at very beginning. Similarly, post-test of both groups was compared. The primary purpose of independent sample t-test was to compare the means of both groups in the beginning and after completing the study. However, any significant difference could not be observed in independent sample t-test on pre-test and post-test of both groups.

**Qualitative Analysis**

To triangulate this experimental study, along with quantitative data, qualitative data was also collected. Triangulation is used for confirmatory and for completeness purposes (Shih, 1998). Interviews were conducted to analyze the study qualitatively. For qualitative data analysis, first of all the recorded interviews were transcribed. Six students were selected from the sample, three students from control group and three students from experimental group for one on one interview. The students with significant difference of marks in pre-test and post-test were selected for interviews to share their experience about the conducted sessions of grammar teaching.

The primary purpose of these one on one interviews was to find support for the quantitative data and present the findings related to teaching methodologies used in this experimental study. Eight questions were planned for this interview. Most of them were answered in Urdu and were later translated in English. Answers were concise although participants of the interviews were encouraged to share their views about the sessions. By asking interview questions a clear feedback was taken from the participants. Discussion about previous experience related to grammar teaching was another aspect that was considered in the interview.
In the previous chapter, data collected through quantitative method that revealed the results about the effectiveness of traditional approach and constructivism on teaching and learning grammar statistically and the views of the participants on grammar learning experience presented a clear idea about the approaches of teaching. These views of the participants explained the results further to analyze the data confidently. Qualitative data must be analyzed wisely by reducing and managing it (Berg, 2009). Therefore, themes from interview were generated from the questions and data were analyzed under these themes.

Collectively, quantitative and qualitative results are inclined towards constructivism. The findings from both the quantitative and qualitative data suggest that the effectiveness and importance of traditional approach cannot be denied, but in comparison to constructivism traditional approach is less effective for the teaching and learning of grammar at the graduate level.

Discussion

As the results of post-test indicated that teaching through constructivism is more effective than teaching through traditional approach because it helps learners to construct knowledge on the basis of prior understanding. Interviews’ results also support this stance as participants show positive attitude towards constructivist approach for learning grammar. Inferential statistics were applied on the collected data and in terms of improvement in grammatical skills, both experimental and regular groups scored higher in the post-test as compared to their performance in the pre-test. It demonstrates that learners in both groups were able to learn the grammar points taught in the separate sessions particularly organized for the current study for each group, but the experimental group performed better than the control group that was taught through traditional approach.

Learners of experimental group supported the point that their learning was enhanced through collaboration as it provides opportunity of learning in blend with enjoyment that is working in pairs and group helped their learning process. Furthermore, they perceived knowledge as novice but came up with specific results; this implies that constructivist approach helps learners more in learning process as it provides collaborative learning. Similarly, as earlier discussed other researches also supported the point that constructivist approach is more effective as compare to traditional approach. The meta-analysis of Ayaz and Sekerci (2015) suggests constructivist approach for learning as it has a positive effect on learners’ academic success, retention and attitude scores. Furthermore, a recent research by Gul (2016) in Turkey on English language teaching to non-native learners; conducted for the awareness of teachers of constructivist approach found that constructivist is effective but teachers need to have its awareness for that purpose he suggested that seminars and trainings are best way to give teachers awareness of constructivist approach. In addition to this, Abdella (2015) in her study explored constructivism as a successful approach for teaching grammar of English language. For the purpose she chose 5Es model described by Bybee et al., (2006) based on constructivism. The results of experimental group that were taught through 5Es model of constructivism scored higher than control group of traditional method. Moreover, Altun and Büyükduman (2007), Yang (2002), and Shunk (2007) also found constructivism as an effective approach for teaching English language to non-native learners. Therefore, from the above discussed studies and results of this research it can be said that interests of the learners of the present era and suggest new learning approach that is constructivism: a new paradigm for English language learning. These studies also show that teachers and educationists advocate constructivism, and believe that by engaging students in constructivist activities a teacher can obtained better results (Nikitina, 2010). Similarly, Cooper (2009) believes that learning is all constructing of conceptual relationship with meaning that a learner makes on his previous experience. Following the previous studies conducted on constructivist approach and the results of this study, it can be suggested that constructivist approach gives more opportunities to learners to construct their own knowledge in a better

The results of the study indicate that learning who were involved in constructivist approach showed better language leaning, but we cannot discard the role of tradition approach in which learners also showed
a certain level of progress. Probably, the reason of this is that as Nawab (2010) mentioned in his research that teaching of language take place as other subject and students get fixed to it and with the development learners develop a particular style of learning that affects their learning process. Furthermore, few studies also say that traditional method for language and grammar learning is somewhat effective, for example Zohrabi and Torabi (2012) suggests teacher centered class for learning grammar rule that is rote learning of grammar rules is an authentic way to learn grammar that helps a lot to implement.

A study by Lam (2009) revealed that traditional approach does trigger the learning process of prepositions, brings a little confidence in students and hardly develops the understanding about the use of prepositions with variation. Similar results are found in the study conducted by Epelde (2015) for the students of bachelors. In his/her study, prepositions were taught through traditional approach in comparison with teaching through activities and games. Findings show that students who were taught through games and activities performed better than those taught through the traditional approach following only the teachers’ instructions. The same happened with participant of this study that the lost their attention in a teacher-controlled classroom with no discussion and room for collaborative learning. Therefore, following the literature and results of the study it can be said that learning of preposition can be paced up with constructivist approach.

Experimental group pointed collaborative environment in classroom help them to easily participate in class discussion. As they were treated with constructivist approach, they unknowingly talked about characteristics of constructivist way of teaching such as relevant, understandable, and useful than randomly-generated materials that impacted learning process and facilitation by the teachers. Furthermore, students supported the point that these features make learning memorable and higher-order thinking skills was activated because in order to provide a relevant example, students understood and applied the principles while completing the tasks. Through the approach of constructivism the control was revoked from the teacher and handed over to the students that helped boost the confidence level not only for understanding but for performing as well. In this condition students learnt more by doing and practicing rather than by observing and listening to the teacher’s instructions. Brown (2008) describes students who learn as architects and initiators, build on their knowledge and student centered approach do not allow them to be passive vessels to receive knowledge to get filled.

Group and pair work of experimental group might be more effective in learning process that becomes the cause of achieving more than traditional method. Group and pair work were appreciated by the students during the interviews. Therefore, we can say that social interaction left a positive impact on learners.

The current research reveals constructivism as a better approach as it has been proved through significant difference in mean score of independent sample test and gain test. The projection before the study was that constructivism is a more effective approach to help learners to improve their performance in the use of grammar. The findings show that constructivism contributed more to improving learners’ performance in grammar.

These results provide a guideline to the teachers for making their decision in terms of grammar teaching that can better facilitate the learning process. The idea of providing rules to memorize and then application of those rules independently is not really supportive for the students of second language learners.

Under graduate students exhibited their interest in grammar learning and showed improvement in a short time. Ergo, applying such approaches in teaching and curriculum can improve the learning process of learners and can help in making language learning flexible.

**Conclusion**
Considering the English language learning a basic requirement of the time, the study was conducted to explore the possibility of effective grammar teaching through constructivism by comparing the effectiveness of constructivist and traditional approach to the teaching of grammar to ESL students at the undergraduate level. The results of the study show improvement in the scores of both control and experimental groups, taught through traditional approach and constructivist approach respectively. However, the mean score of post-test presented constructivist approach to be a more effective teaching approach for grammar teaching at undergraduate level as compared to the traditional approach.

Participants of the interview specified grammar as a neglected area in schools of Pakistan. For grammar teaching neither content nor methods are considered in most of the schools. The findings of the current study may help in this regard to overcome the existing problem of teaching and learning English in our context. The result of the present study supports constructivism as compared to conventional method of teaching, for teaching and learning grammar in ESL. The constructivist approach does not support only the students of university level but at school level teachers may get benefits from this evolving method for teaching English.

It is important to bring a change in teaching approaches for Pakistani students. Obsolete methods are still followed in our education system whereas variations in education system including teaching methods are accepted all over the world. With the shift of teacher centered to student centered learning, Pakistani students should explore the new paradigm and experience the construction of knowledge on their own to compete their counter partners in the other parts of the world. In this situation the role and the responsibility of an English language teacher has increased, for developing efficient skills related to English language (Ahmad & Rao, 2013)

**Recommendation**

**Teacher Training.**

The results of the study recommend student centered class in teaching and learning process. Constructivism demands teachers as facilitators and guides to direct towards learning. For this purpose, designing of interesting workshops and training sessions can be helpful.

**Curriculum/ Syllabus.**

To follow constructivism in English language classes, syllabus and curriculum need to be considered. Modification in the syllabus is required to make the classes’ student centered. Content of the text books should be designed according to constructivist approach and relevant accordingly and relevant exercises must be designed in which students can share knowledge with other participants.

**Further Research**

Educational research is not very common in Pakistan (Hashmi, 2000). As mentioned earlier, in Pakistan, constructivism does not seem to be a very popular area for research especially in terms of grammar teaching. Effectiveness of constructivism needs to be explored in other areas of grammar. Similarly, all areas of English language teaching and learning need to be explored under constructivism.

**References**


Rivers, W. M. (1981). *Teaching foreign-language skills; ERIC.*


FACTORS FOR ACHIEVING SUSTAINABLE COMPETITIVE ADVANTAGE IN TEXTILE UNITS OF PUNJAB, PAKISTAN

Rabia Khand
Department of Business Management
NUML University, Multan Campus, Pakistan

ABSTRACT

Textile industry is the biggest manufacturing industry and second largest employment generating sector in Pakistan. Pakistan’s textile sector can stand a better chance of attracting biggest foreign investors in textiles by having a unique competitive advantage compared to other developing countries if it can cope with environmental regulations and Quality standards, increase in competition from other industries and inculcate proper compliance and management practices. Hence, this study aims to explore the effects of environmental organizational culture and environmental leadership on sustainable competitive advantage through a partial mediator green organizational identity.

The first objective of this study is to develop the concept of green organization identity. It can help organization achieve competitive advantage over rest of the firms. The second objective is to improve management thinking to stimulate green opportunities and innovations. The final objective of the study is sustainable competitive advantage which will help the future generations to save their resources.

Using self-administered questionnaires, data was collected from 232 top managers various textile units in Punjab using rigorous statistical techniques to explore the nature of relationship among variables by examining construct validity and normality. To identify the extent of effects variables cast upon each other, the technique of Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) is applied through AMOS 20 yielding interesting insights about association among variables.

The research findings have provided support to the conceptual framework showing positive results for both direct and indirect relationships among variables thus endowing with quantitative model and insights.

The study carries both academic and managerial implications, future directions and recommendations that can provide base for future studies.

Key words: environmental organizational culture, environmental leadership, green organizational identity, sustainable competitive advantage
1. INTRODUCTION

The rising consumer awareness in environment changes the context of competition in the industries around the world. Now it is not only necessary to adopt a preventive approach to environmental pollution to protect the environment but also important to improve business. In recent years, due to enormous amount of environmental pollution, which directly connects with industrial manufacturing in the world, the society has noticed environmental issues increasingly (Chen, 2008b). There are more environmental forces influencing companies operations such as the environment policies of governments, national and international environmental regulations, stakeholder activism and environmentalism and competitive pressures (Rugman & Verbeke, 1998). Therefore, companies have no choice but to carry out environmental protection activities to comply with international regulations of environmental protection and environmental consciousness of consumers (Berry & M. R ( 1998). Instead of compliance, more and more companies are willing to accept the responsibility of being less harmful to the environment because of the strategic consideration (Chen, 2008b). Businesses that adopt proactive environmental management strategies could integrate the objectives of environmental protections with different departments in companies to solve the environmental problems by utilizing innovative environmental strategies. Therefore, there is a need in management fields to anticipate and to plan for environmental concerns and to incorporate this thinking into corporate strategies (Haden et al; 2009). Resource based view (RBV) says that environmental social responsibility can constitute a resource or capability that leads to a sustained competitive advantage (Hart, 1995).

This study focuses on discussing the new concept of environment management through green organizational identity which is in compliance with environmental trends to help companies enhance their sustainable competitive advantage. It is based on the theory of organizational identity. Organizational identity is a set of beliefs about what requires most care, enduring, and distinctive about an organization (Albert & Whetton, 1985). Green organizational identity is a motivator that influences actions of people in an organization (Corley et. al; 2006).

When concern for environment becomes an integral component of organizational identity, environmental issues become harder to ignore (Weick, 1988).

For managers these environmental challenges could be turned into business opportunities. This study focuses on discussing the new concept of environment management green organizational identity in compliance with environmental trends to help companies enhance their sustainable competitive advantage. It is based on the theory of organizational identity. This study develops a green organizational identity framework to fill the research gap. Environmental organizational culture is embedded within organizations and in addition, environmental leaders affect interpretation of environmental issues. This study develops a framework to explore managerial implications.

Environmental organizational culture is intensely rooted within the organizations and it shows how environmental issues are being interpreted. Environmental leadership represents organizational identity with respect to environmental issues. As the leader of any organization affects the interpretation of environmental issues. So, the antecedents of green organizational identity are basically environmental organizational culture and environmental leadership and its consequent is sustainable competitive advantage.

1.1 Problem Statement and Research Questions

Although there is a wide literature available on environmental organizational culture, environmental leadership and green organizational identity and sustainable competitive advantage, yet an explanation of latent processes governing these mechanisms stay under emphasized. This study attempts to explore the
relationship between environmental organizational culture, environmental leadership, green organizational identity and sustainable competitive advantage to recognize the association among these constructs and examine the effect of these constructs on each other.

The objective of the research is to find out the answers of questions given below:

i. What is the impact of environmental organizational culture of firm on green organizational identity?

ii. What is the impact of environmental organizational culture of a firm on sustainable competitive advantage?

iii. What is the impact of green organizational identity on sustainable competitive advantage?

iv. What is the meditational role of green organizational identity on the relationship between sustainable competitive advantage and environmental organizational culture?

v. What is the impact of environmental leadership on green organizational identity?

vi. What is the impact of environmental leadership on sustainable competitive advantage?

vii. What is the meditational role of green organization identity on the relationship between sustainable competitive advantage and environmental leadership?

1.2 Research Objectives

i. The first objective of this study is to develop the concept of green organization identity. It can help organization get the competitive advantage over rest of the firms.

ii. The second objective of this study is to improve management thinking to stimulate the green opportunities and innovations.

iii. The final objective of the study is sustainable competitive advantage which will help the future generation to save their resources.

1.3 Research approach and Methodology

The present study adds to the body of the research on green organizational identity and it is conducted in current scenario of 2014-2015 in Pakistan (Punjab), tested in different cultures of textile industry. Self-administered questionnaires are used to collect data. The managers at top level and in various departments are briefed about the research and terms and then asked to give their honest views. This helps the existing investors and corporate owners in this region (Punjab) to disclose their information regarding green organization identity as a sustainable competitive advantage.
1.4 Organization of the Study

This research thesis consists of five sections, brief description of each section is given below: Section one is focusing on the backdrop of the research, the objectives and extent of the study predicament report. Section two consists of the development of thesis through a review of literature. Section three discusses in detail, research methodology, data collection, operationalization of variables, testing of thesis. Section four gives detail analysis of findings through application of different statistical tools. Section five is focusing on the outcome of the investigation and the explanation of the statistics obtained from the examination of facts. It includes a contrast between current study and previous work. Study limitations and how to proceed for future research applications are also mentioned in this section.

2. LITERATURE REVIEW AND DEVELOPMENT OF THESIS

2.1 Environmental Organizational Culture and Green Organizational identity

Culture defined in terms of meaning characterized to human systems as opposed to other social systems, and on the other hand, those particular features by which human systems can be distinguished from each other. The later dimension implies that culture is closely related to the notion of identity. Identity can be thought of as a pattern or a structure continuously recognized and validated as unique, autonomous and relatively stable in time and space (Wiegert et.al., 2004). Contemporary organizations foster motivation and inner loyalty and, in this way, attract the new employees to identify with the organization and its goals. They demonstrate themselves and through their various publications, something special, this particular identity in a culture without foundation, the significance of such messages should not be underestimated (Berg & Kreiner 1990). Identity is a concept rooted in psychology and sociology where it is used to characterize an individual in relation to larger cultural system (Goffman, 1967).

H1: Environmental organizational culture has positive effect on green organizational identity.

2.2 Sustainable competitive advantage and Environmental Organizational Culture

Sustainable competitive advantage is the unique position of a firm in relation to its competitors that permits to outperform them consistently (Hofer & Schendel, 1978). Culture can be a competitive resource a source of valuable and rare cultures are part of firm’s history and heritage.

H2: Environmental organizational culture has positive effect on sustainable competitive Advantage.

2.3 Green Organizational Identity and Sustainable Competitive Advantage
Green competitive advantage is a condition under which firms occupies some positions about environmental management or green innovation where their competitors cannot copy its successful environmental strategies and they can gain the sustainable benefits from these successful environmental strategies. (Barney, 1986) argued that if a firm’s culture is valuable, unique, and imperfectly imitable, then its culture can provide sustained competitive advantages. The organizational culture of the environmental issue as an integral part of organizational identity is one of the key elements for the achievement of superior environmental performance in companies (Egri& Herman, 2000; Sharma, 2000; Fernández et al., 2003). Thus, from the view of organizational culture as a strategic tool, firms can obtain competitive advantages from their valuable, unique, and imperfectly imitable organizational cultures (Fiol, 1991).

"Green organizational identity” is an interpretive scheme about environmental management and protection that members collectively construct to provide meaning to their behaviors. This study develops an original green organizational identity framework to explore the positive effects of environmental organizational culture and environmental leadership on green competitive advantage via green organizational identity.

**H3:** green organizational identity has effects sustainable competitive advantage.

**H4:** green organizational identity mediates relationship between environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage

### 2.4 Environmental leadership and Sustainable Competitive Advantage

A recent paper by (Waldman et al., 2004) applies strategic leadership theory to CSR. These authors conjecture that certain aspects of transformational leadership will be positively correlated with the propensity of firms to engage in CSR and that these leaders will employ CSR activities strategically. To the extent that firms engage in CSR strategically, this behavior can be examined through the lens of the resource-based-view-of-the-firm (RBV) which presumes that resources and capabilities are valuable, rare, inimitable and non-substitutable, they can constitute a source of sustainable competitive advantage.

**H5:** Environmental leadership has a positive effect on sustainable competitive advantage

The top management vision and leadership is opened to external influence via its concern to manage organizational image. Whenever this influence occurs, the statements, decisions and actions of top management directs to its internal audiences are influenced by external forces and affects the organizational identity.

The marketing approach describes the external audiences e.g. through products, communications, behavior and environment. (Hatch & Schultz, 1997), argue that organizational identity need to be theorized in relation to culture and image of organization so, the organizational identity dance between organizational culture and organizational images.

The leaders formulate their vision, create cultures, and values by communicating with, and by being highly visible to employees, customers, suppliers, etc. A model of leadership helps in identifying and developing potential in employees and maintains their best fit of time span, personal traits and qualities. Environmental Leadership pays attention to market change and technological obsolescence as well as motivating and inspiring the employees.

**H6:** environmental leadership has positive effect on green organizational identity

**H7:** green organizational identity mediates relationship between environmental leadership and sustainable competitive advantage.
3. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The research is designed in such a way that it establishes a logical relationship between our variables Green Organizational Identity (GOI), Environmental Leadership (EL), Green Organizational Culture (GOC) and Sustainable Competitive advantage (SCA). Sustainable competitive advantage (SCA) in this study is forecasted with two independent variables, a dependent variable and a mediator.

3.1: Operationalization of variables, Data Instrument and Collection

The study applied questionnaire survey with items adopted from (Chen, 2011) for variables SCA, GOI, EOC and EL to verify hypothesis. The items were measured using ‘five points Likert scale’ from scores 1 to 5 with 1 denoting ‘strongly agree’ to 5 denoting ‘strongly disagree’. There were several reasons for selecting textile mills in Punjab, Pakistan. Firstly, textile industry is the biggest manufacturing industry and second largest employment generating sector in Pakistan (Samad et.al, 2015). The textile industry of Pakistan faces 6 environmental regulations and Quality standards. According to Federal Environment Protection agency, textile industry of Pakistan is categorized as level-A (highest) on the basis of level of pollution generated (Samad et. al, 2015). Previous researches show that only large firms adopted management practices and comply with regulations. Small and medium firms do not have a code for environmental protection. With proper compliance and management practices, Pakistan’s textile sector with Green Organizational Identity can stand a better chance of attracting biggest foreign investors in textiles by having a unique competitive advantage compared to other developing countries.

On the basis of variables which are defined earlier in the chapter, the self-administered questionnaires have been used for the collection of data. Purposive sampling is based on the characteristics of population and objective of study. We used multistage purposive sampling; in the first stage we gathered data from those who were involved with finished goods. In the second stage we collected data from those who were involved in decision making process and participated in strategy formulation. Multi stage sampling was selected as our data was widespread and included five different cities of Punjab. The respondents of questionnaire were CEO’s, managers of environmental, marketing, HR, manufacturing, R&D, departments in textile companies.

The survey questionnaire was sent to higher level Managers of textile industry in Multan, Faisalabad, Vehari, Muzaffargarh, Lahore and Rawalpindi. 232 responses were received out of 312 in 2014-2015. This was 62% percent response rate. Statistical package for social sciences (SPSS)-20 were used in the study to analyze the collected data which was coded in according to the scale as per defined in the questionnaires, which were given to the managers of the firms. SPSS-20 had been used to analyze the data including complete descriptive statistics, correlation co-efficient among variables and to check the reliability of instrument. It was also used for conducting factor analysis including the exploratory factor analysis (EFA), the results of which were used in AMOS for conducting the confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). Structural equation modeling had been used to analyze the hypotheses and the proposed model. Analysis of moment structures (AMOS) were also used for the analysis of data by using the structural equation modelling (SEM) to estimate the data collected.
4. ANALYSIS AND RESULTS

This section presents detailed analysis of survey data and highlights the outcomes of Structural Equation Modelling (SEM) via AMOS measurement model and structural model to test and discuss hypothesis.

4.1 Structural Equation Modelling

Structural Equation Modelling was performed in three stages:
In the first step, Measurement model was performed using confirmatory factor analysis CFA for its evaluation. Using confirmatory factor analysis CFA, the underlying structure of the latent variable known based on prior knowledge and empirical research making the base of this knowledge, the relations between the observed and latent variables was postulated and then statistically tested (Byrne, 2010).

4.2 Fit Indices

Fit indices were determined to indicate the degree of consistency between the pattern of permanent and parameter of the experimental data set to that of variances and co-variances (Suhr,2006). According to (Steen Kamp et al., 2003), the moderating affects were then calculated by using the indices of chi-square, CFI and TLI. To provide best fit of model. The model fit consists of different types of indices measures each having threshold values for the fitness of model. Based on prior studies, following values were used as a threshold for fit indices: RMSEA (0.05-0.10) (Mc Callum et. al, 1996), RFI (0-1) ( Bollen , 1986), TLI (0.80 or a threshold of ≥0.9) (Bentler&Hu, 1999). Based on prior studies, the table below shows fit indices threshold used in this study.

**SEM FIT indices for the study**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level of Model Fit</th>
<th>Overall Model Fit</th>
<th>Overall Model Fit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Measure fit</td>
<td>Model Fit</td>
<td>Model Comparison</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>CMIN/DF</td>
<td>IFI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For Further Analysis</td>
<td>&gt;2</td>
<td>&gt;.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Range for Good and Adequate Fit</td>
<td>&lt;2</td>
<td>&lt;.06(up-to range of .08)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Fig.1: SEM FIT INDICES ADAPTED FROM BYRNE (2001) HOLMES-SMITH ET AL. (2004) USED IN THE STUDY.
In this study, there were four variables, two independent, one dependent, and one mediator. Independent variables included environmental organizational culture and environmental leadership. Where the environmental organizational culture contained six items and environmental leadership contained four items. The dependent variable sustainable competitive advantage had thirteen items. The green organizational identity which was the mediator had six items. For each of these measurement models, first order CFA is conducted representing loadings and Critical Ratio and fit indices are reported. The overall structural model is developed, and the model fit was then assessed. The table below shows the Fit Indices results of each variable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Final no. of items</th>
<th>CMIN/DF</th>
<th>RMSEA</th>
<th>IFI</th>
<th>TLI</th>
<th>CFI</th>
<th>Composite Reliability (CR)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Organizational Culture</td>
<td>5-3.365</td>
<td>0.085</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Leadership</td>
<td>3-3.16</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td>0.947</td>
<td>0.964</td>
<td>0.874</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green Organizational Identity</td>
<td>6-4.27</td>
<td>0.071</td>
<td>0.983</td>
<td>0.954</td>
<td>0.986</td>
<td>0.746</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable competitive Advantage</td>
<td>13-2.73</td>
<td>6.52</td>
<td>0.996</td>
<td>0.974</td>
<td>0.996</td>
<td>0.687</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

After modifying initial model, the fit indices in the final model indicates that the model is well with all the values with in the threshold given in the table above. After eliminating some items from initial fit, to achieve a model fit, the final model is reliable as shown by Composite Reliability for each construct.

**4.3 Overall measurement model fit**
This very part of the study is most important as it contributes to the overall measurement model by combining all confirmatory factor analysis and EFA’s, explanatory factor analysis that were discussed in the previous sections for verification of dimensionality of measure. The study shows the model is being measured through dependent variables and independent variables. It has been decided that only two items have been exuded from model to get a better fit on the basis of results obtained from both CFA and EFA. The items have been deleted due to low standardized loading of an item on various factors. In this part, an overall model has been tested to analyze adequacy of measurement model. This model was further proceeded through to examine the structures of covariance of both independent and dependent variables. The proposed model has been measured with all items and the competing model has been measured with excluded items. Initially it has been tested by using all the 34 items, proposed model statistics showed a weak fit after which it was tested with expelled items. The results of both models are depicted below.

Table No. 4.15

Validity Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>CR</th>
<th>AVE</th>
<th>EOC</th>
<th>GOI</th>
<th>EL</th>
<th>SCA</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EOC</td>
<td>0.690</td>
<td>0.533</td>
<td><strong>0.730</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOI</td>
<td>0.757</td>
<td>0.545</td>
<td>0.632</td>
<td><strong>0.738</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EL</td>
<td>0.781</td>
<td>0.573</td>
<td>0.769</td>
<td>0.698</td>
<td><strong>0.756</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCA</td>
<td>0.892</td>
<td>0.590</td>
<td>0.516</td>
<td>0.825</td>
<td>0.561</td>
<td><strong>0.768</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Author’s own calculation by using AMOS

FIG 3: VALIDITY ANALYSIS

4.4

Mediation Analysis

For testing mediation, this study followed the procedure of Baron and Kenny’s test. For mediation analysis between environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage through green organization identity, three steps of Baron and Kenny’s test were employed. In step 1, sustainable competitive advantage has been regressed on Environmental organizational culture. In second step, Green organization identity has been regressed on Environmental organizational culture. In step three, sustainable competitive advantage has been regressed on Environmental organizational culture and Green organization identity results of each step are shown in table that reveal that Environmental organizational culture has positive impact on Green organization identity \( (B=.507) \) and identity is added between Environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage, the mediation effect emerged as significant. This shows partial mediation as B value of Environmental organizational culture is decreased to .113 and p value is .051 which is greater than .05.
The results of mediation between EOC and EOC through GOI are summarized in the table:

**Mediation analysis between environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage through green organization identity**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>S.E</th>
<th>Beta</th>
<th>t</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Step 1: sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental organizational culture</td>
<td>.071</td>
<td>.414</td>
<td>6.896</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 2: Green organization identity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental organizational culture</td>
<td>.065</td>
<td>.507</td>
<td>8.914</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Step 3: sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental organizational culture</td>
<td>.135</td>
<td>.113</td>
<td>1.961</td>
<td>.051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Green organization identity</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>.593</td>
<td>10.284</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FIG 4: MEDIATION ANALYSIS BETWEEN EOC AND SCA THROUGH**

**4.5 Hypothesis testing**

This part describes the effects of independent variable (EOC, EL) on dependent variable (SCA) and also describes effect of GOI as a mediator on dependent variable. It is used to answer the questions raised in the beginning and to describe that the hypotheses proposed are supported or not supported.
Hypothesis testing and results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>S.E</th>
<th>T</th>
<th>P</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>H1:</strong> Environmental organizational culture has positive effect on green organization identity</td>
<td>.065</td>
<td>8.914</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H2:</strong> Environmental organizational culture has positive effect on sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td>.071</td>
<td>6.896</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H3:</strong> Green organizational identity has effects sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td>.052</td>
<td>13.01</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H4:</strong> Green organizational identity mediates relationship between environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td>.060</td>
<td>10.28</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H5:</strong> Environmental leadership has positive effect on sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td>.059</td>
<td>7.967</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H6:</strong> Environmental leadership has positive effect green organizational identity</td>
<td>.053</td>
<td>9.982</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>H7:</strong> Green organizational identity mediates relationship between environmental leadership and sustainable competitive advantage</td>
<td>.062</td>
<td>9.567</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>Supported</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FIG 5: HYPOTHESIS TESTING AND RESULTS**

4.6 Comparison of Proposed and Competing Model

The removal of two items entranced the fit statistics as X2 value which also played role in perfection of overall measurement model modification indices also played role to achieve the measurement fit, so, the 26-items of different variables provided logical fit between measurement of model and data. Along with the removal of 2-items, the modification also put in an effort with removal of these 2-items in order to provide a model fit statistics. The test of the modification indices pointed out 2 items to be covariate whose values were more than threshold value of p < 0.05 so the overall model fit improved.

5. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The relationship between environmental organizational culture and green organizational identity is significant as p=.000, B= 0.507 and t-value=8.914. This clearly indicates that there exists positive relationship between constructs. So, these findings support H1 and explain that environmental organizational culture is deep rooted shared practices, organizational identity is dependent on it. (Hatch and Schultz, 2002).

These results leads to the findings that culture is an integral part of organizational identity. These findings are consistent with prior studies focusing on the culture which is perceived as interpretive frame that guides
behaviours and process of sense making (Denison and Mishra, 1995). According to Hutch and Schultz (1997) organizational culture needs to be considered in explanations of the development and maintenance of organizational identity.

Table shows the path co-efficient from environmental organizational culture to sustainable competitive advantage is significant with \( p = .000 \), \( B = .492 \), \( t \)-value=6.896. The value of standardizing estimate shows that there is positive relationship between environmental organizational culture and sustainable competitive advantage. Thus it supports H2 and explains that strong organizational culture becomes the source of sustainable competitive advantage of the firm.

These findings are consistent with prior studies advocating that organizational culture is a strategic tool through which firms can obtain sustainable competitive advantage from their valuable, unique and imperfectly imitable organizational culture. (Fid, 1991).

The result from above table reveals that the regression path from green organizational identity to sustainable competitive advantage is significant with \( P = .000 \), \( t = 13.001 \), \( B = .679 \). This leads to the acceptance of the hypothesis (H3) which states that green organizational identity has positive relationship with sustainable competitive advantage. This shows that organizational identity as a “core competence” can lead to sustainable advantage by providing meaning to new adaptive behavior that is the behavior organizational identity represents a “non-imitable” resource thus results in sustainable competitive advantage (Fiol, 2001).

The relationship between environmental leadership and green organizations identity is significant as \( p \) value=.000, \( t = 9.982 \) and \( B = .530 \). Which clearly indicates that there exist positive relationships between these constructs. It explains that environmental leadership and green organizational identity are deeply rooted shared practices as leadership is a dynamic process in which one “individual” influences others to contribute to the achievement of the group task (Cole, 1996). Top managers can actually stimulate the motives for seeking organizational changes made to improve environmental performance and to gain the commercial and competitive benefits through environmental leadership. So, the organizational identity is formed by top leaders interpretations and beliefs interpretations and beliefs that guide and drive the organizations behaviour of employees (Foreman and Whetten, 2002). Leadership can be considered as a symbol of organizational identity as it influences what employees perceive, feel and think about the organization (Hutch and Schultz, 1997).

The table above provides the relationship between environmental leadership to sustainable competitive advantage is significant with \( p = .000 \), \( B = .468 \), \( t \)-value=7.967. The value of standardized estimate shows that there is positive relationship between environmental leadership and sustainable competitive advantage. It explains that leaders create a view that “influences” their members values, commitments, and aspirations they intent to achieve in the environmental issue which is interpreted by them (Fernandez et al; 2003). Environmental leaders can confirm the outstanding outcomes environmental development because they can stimulate an environmental vision to become part of organizational identity has hence proved to be the sustainable competitive advantage (.Fernandez et at; 2000).

### 5.1 Managerial Implications and Conclusions

This research work can be seen as an important contribution as it can be helpful for the organization at all levels. It can help and improve the HR activities and managers in attaining and retaining the skilled employees that is important need for an organization to survive in this competitive world. Employees overall relationship with the organization can be improved by understanding the factors such as environmental organizational culture, environmental leadership, environmental organizational identity and sustainable competitive advantage.
The current study is fruitful for managers in understanding the motives behind their desire to continue their relationship with their organization; sustainable competitive advantage can become the competitive advantage for the firm. By improving the environmental leadership and environmental organization culture the work environment in the organization can improve their relationship with their employees.

The resources of an organization can be saved when the environmental culture and environmental leadership is maintained in an organization. Cost-reducing is effective in such an organization. A good relationship can be built by reducing or eliminating the conflicts in the organization as the resources are depleting.

5.2 Research limitations and future scope

As textile units of Punjab are used to collect data so the results cannot be generalized and the results may not be implied to other industries which have different cultural values and parameters. It is recommended to do further studies to fill this breach. Secondly, due to limitation of time and resources, the study could not observe the dynamic change of green organizational identity, environmental organizational culture, environmental leadership and sustainable competitive advantage in different stages of development. Therefore, future studies can explore it.
APPENDIX I: STRUCTURAL MODEL REPRESENTING INDEPENDENT, DEPENDENT AND MEDIATING VARIABLES
REFERENCES


Optimization of an indirect ELISA for the detection of infectious bursal disease virus antibodies

Sanaullah Sajid¹, Sajjad Ur Rahman¹, Mudasser Habib²

¹Institute of Microbiology, University of Agriculture, Faisalabad
²Animal Science Division, Nuclear Institute for Agriculture and Biology, Faisalabad

ABSTRACT

Indirect ELISA was developed for the determination of antibody titers of sera collected from poultry birds vaccinated against infectious bursal disease. Using positive and negative serum controls, standard procedure was adopted. IBD antigenic protein (VP2) was made by isolating the virus from bursal of Fabricius and then making it recombinant using Escherichia coli pET-28a expression system. Protein was expressed by SDS-PAGE and purified through affinity column. Optimized dilutions of protein (25µg/ml) and sera (100 times dilution) were used to develop i-ELISA. The developed ELISA was evaluated in immunized birds by determining their post-vaccinated antibody titer at alternate days. Indirect ELISA gave reproducible results from day 3rd to 21st with mean value of 0.39, 1.56, 2.38, 2.99, 2.67, 2.32 and 1.47 respectively and saved cost and time as compared to the commercial kits. These antigen coated plates may be stored in refrigerator and used under field conditions to get the rapid detection of IBD. Based on this study i-ELISA developed indigenously may replace the commercially available ELISA kits.

Keywords: antibody titer, IBD, I-ELISA, Serum

Introduction

The major contribution in global livestock share is poultry industry. The short productive span, reproductive traits, distribution throughout the world and egg production favors the use of poultry as a major protein source (Aricibasi, 2010). Poultry industry plays an important role in economic development and alleviation of poverty in Pakistan but the diseases, especially immunosuppressive viral diseases like Infectious bursal disease (IBD) is a major threat to the poultry industry.

IBD is an infectious disease of fowl which cause atrophy and necrosis of bursa of Fabricius. Infectious bursal disease (IBD) was first reported in broilers in Sussex, USA in 1962 (Abdu et al., 1986). While it was firstly reported in Karachi, Pakistan in 1971 (Bughio et al., 2017). The initial outbreaks of infectious bursal disease occurred in and around Gumboro, Delaware due to this reason IBD is also known as Gumboro disease that was described as infectious and contagious by Cosgrove in the year 1962 (Jackwood, 1982).
Due to the characteristic kidney lesion of this disease, Cosgrove referred this as avian nephritis. The causative agent of this disease was filtered from bursa of Fabricius in 1962 by Winterfield and named as infectious bursal disease virus causing infectious bursal disease in birds (Knoblich, 2000).

IBDV is non-enveloped, bisegmented dsRNA belong to Avibirnaviridae genus of Birnaviridae family mainly infecting broilers that leads to immunosuppression in birds (Fatima, 2013). Virion has icosahedral symmetry, consist of single capsid of 32 capsomere having diameter of 60-70 nm. It has two serotypes, serotype 1 varies in pathogenicity and serotype 2 is non-pathogenic. IBD Virus has 2 segments A and B. Larger genome segment A (34bp) encodes VP2, VP3, VP4 and VP5 proteins and segment B is the smaller genome of 2800bp that encodes for Vp1. Vp1 is the protein which is responsible for the mRNA synthesis and replication of virus. With the infection of a cell with virus, specific ssRNA and dsRNA are synthesized. Nucleic acid replication takes place by strand displacement mechanism demonstrated by (VPg) viral genome linked proteins. Ribonucleoprotein complex formed by dsRNA genome wrapped by VP3, occupy the inner capsid of infectious bursal disease virus. This VP3 linked covalently to VPg form Vp1 and during transcription this Vp1 free molecules act both as primer and polymerase (Mutinda, 2016).

IBD is highly infectious disease of poultry causing 60 to 100% mortality and immunosuppression in young chickens of 3 to 6 weeks age. Incidence of IBD in higher in layer birds than in broiler (Radostits et al., 2000). After infection the virus starts replicating in the macrophages and lymphocytes of GALT (Gut Associated Lymphoid Tissue). Then via blood it affects the bursa and destroys the B cells due to necrosis and apoptosis leads to the immunosuppression (Berg, 2000).

Natural host of infectious bursal disease virus is domestic fowl. Turkeys do not show clinical signs but considered to be affected with IBDV and serological evidence was observed in ducks and penguins (Banda, 2002). Dogs are considered as a carrier or reservoir of infectious bursal disease virus if fed on infected birds and IBD virus is detected in its feces indicates that it is capable of spreading infection to healthy birds (Eregae, 2014). Microscopically lesions are observed in bursa with inflammation signs leading to hyperemic, hypertrophic and edematous bursa. Mucosal surface of bursa gives yellowish colour accompanied by petechial hemorrhages. Earlier bursa becomes enlarged that comes to normal by 5th day and reduces to less than 3rd of normal size by 8th day (Berg, 2000).

IBDV is extremely resistant and can survive in poultry farm pens and feed for several weeks to months. No evidence has been present still for the vertical transmission i.e. in eggs (Habte, 2004) but infectious bursal disease spread horizontally either direct contact or indirectly through fomites, equipments, farm workers and contaminated feed, water and litter (Bughio et al., 2017). Primary method to control infectious bursal disease virus is immunization achieved through maternal antibodies in young chicks (Fatima, 2013).
For the evaluation of vaccine programme and diagnostic purposes, detection of infectious bursal disease virus antibodies is a valuable tool. Virus neutralization assay is a specific tool for the detection of antibodies particular to a specific strain but this is laborious, time taking and expensive assay to perform in laboratory (Durairaj, 2012). Infectious bursal disease virus can be identified through ELISA. Enzyme Linked Immunosorbent Assay is very sensitive assay to measure changes in enzyme activities utilizing enzyme conjugated antibodies with antigen or antibody involved in immune reaction. Its application is the highly sensitive detection of disease related antibodies and its quantification (Paulie and Perlmann, 2003). The development of ELISA has played important role in the detection of IBD virus using monoclonal antibodies. The main focus of this study is the antigenicity of VP2 protein to detect anti-IBDV antibodies in enzyme linked immunosorbent assay, which will serve as safe, chemically defined and non-infectious serodiagnosis method.

**Materials and Methods**

**Isolation of virus**

Infected bursa was taken from field outbreaks and confirmed through histopathological examination. Viral RNA was extracted using FavorPrep® Nucleic Acid Extraction kit (Favorgen® Biotech).

**Amplification of IBDV-VP2**

The VP2 was amplified with the use of reverse transcriptase polymerase chain reaction (RT-PCR) kit by ABM® (Applied Biological Materials). The primers BGF: 3´- CATATGTGCAGCGATGATTACC-3´ and BGR: 3´- CCTGGAATTCTCAGGGGAGAGTTG -5´ amplified the partial VP2 from base 751 to base 1449 of genome segment A. The start codon in forward primer is underlined. For the VP2 reaction the PCR was at initial denaturation at 94°C for 4 minutes followed by 35 cycles of 94°C for 45 seconds, 57.6°C for 45 seconds and 72°C for 90 seconds while the final polymerization is at 72°C for 10 minutes.

**Preparation of IBDV gene clones**

Plasmid was isolated from *Escherichia coli* by alkaline lysis method. After restriction digestion of plasmid and insert DNA with EcoRI and Ndel, the 699-bp product of VP2 was inserted into pET-28a vector and ligation reaction was incubated overnight at 16°C. Plasmid was used to transform the *E. coli* strain BL21. Transformed bacteria was grown on LB-agar containing 100 µg/ml and incubated at 37°C overnight. White transparent colonies were confirmed by colony PCR and visualized on 1% agarose gel.

**Expression and purification of recombinant VP2 protein**

The VP2 protein was subjected to SDS-PAGE and the purification of 6x His-tagged protein was done by Ni-NTA purification system. Ni-NTA column has the affinity for six tandem histidine residues containing
recombinant fusion protein. It uses nitrilotriacetic acid (NTA) in a cross linked 6x agarose matrix that binds Ni ions by four coordination sites.

**Optimization of i-ELISA**
Initially IBDV antibody negative and positive serum (serum from normal healthy birds and serum collected post infection) was taken to determine the appropriate dilutions. Control sera were taken from twenty experimental birds vaccinated with Bursaplex vaccine. Protein was diluted in carbonate-bicarbonate buffer to 25, 50 and 100 times for coating on ELISA plates and tested against the similar dilutions of negative and positive sera for their OD$_{450}$ values. Most suitable dilution was chosen and depending upon their highest P/N value and adopted as an optimized dilution. (P/N value: Positive sera OD$_{450}$ divided by negative sera OD$_{450}$)

**Development of Indirect Enzyme Linked Immunosorbent Assay (I-ELISA)**
Antigen (100 µl) diluted in coating buffer was dispensed in all the wells. Plate was incubated at 4°C overnight and washed three times with PBST. Blocked with 5% skimmed milk in 0.02M PBS. Serum diluted with 0.5% skimmed milk in PBST was added and incubated for 1 hour at 37°C. Peroxidase conjugated antibodies diluted with 0.5% skimmed milk was added to each well and incubated for 1.5 hour at 37°C. After incubation plate was washed with PBST three times. Chromogenic substrate OPD freshly prepared was added to each well up to 100µl. Plate was protected from light and incubated at 37°C until suitable color development. Reaction was stopped by adding 50µl of 2M H$_2$SO$_4$ in all the wells. Directly from the bottom of micro well plate, results were read at 450nm using SpectraMax M2 microplate reader and SoftMax Pro software.

**Results**

**Histopathology**
Bursa samples were fixed in 10% neutral buffered formalin. The histopathology procedure was adopted and tissues sections were stained with H & E (Haematoxylin and Eosin). Examination of bursa tissues under a microscope at 4X, 10X and 40X revealed the fibrosis in bursa with severe lymphocytic depletion in cortex region and infiltration of inflammatory cells.
Fig. 3.1 (a) Histopathology of Bursa of Fabricius shows lymphocytic depletion in cortex region

Fig. 3.1 (b) Histopathology of Bursa of Fabricius shows infiltration of inflammatory cells

**RT-PCR**

The Primers were designed to conserved region that amplify 699 bp fragment of IBDV VP2 gene. RT-PCR was conducted and the final product was run on gel to get the desired bands.
Expression of VP2 protein

Recombinant proteins expression was analyzed in supernatant and sediments. Heated the samples at 90 °C for 5 minutes and 30 µl form each sample was loaded. Gel was run at 150 V current and the gel was subjected to Coomassie staining and visualized. Proteins were over expressed as inclusion bodies.

Optimization of Protein and serum dilutions for ELISA

IBDV negative and positive serum samples were compared to determine the appropriate dilutions. The optimized condition for I-ELISA was 25µg/ml for coating protein and 100 times serum dilution of samples.
Determination of antibody titer by I-ELISA developed using recombinant VP2-IBDV

Developed i-ELISA kit was evaluated with the positive sera from the 50 poultry birds. One day old chicks were tagged and vaccinated with commercial vaccine Bursaplex (Zoetis, USA). 0.2ml of the vaccine was injected subcutaneously. Sera samples were collected at days 3rd, 5th, 7th, 10th, 14th and 21st. ELISA was performed using positive samples while negative run as a control. Result showed: (1) VP2 was more antigen and suitable for coating as an antigen for i-ELISA; (2) Sera samples at different days were tested and substantial difference was observed; (3) The vaccinated sera samples at different days were collected and tested with developed i-ELISA kit expressed the titer as OD\(_{450}\) values were higher at day 7th. Then a marked decrease was observed after day 7th to 21st.

**Fig. 3.4 Optimization of I-ELISA kit using positive and negative serum samples**
**Discussion**

The poultry industry of Pakistan has reached to the level of self-sufficiency during the last few years. Fast growth of the poultry industry has encouraged a lot of people to invest and adopt the poultry farming as business and source of income. However, in spite of favorable conditions and availability of high producing birds, the poultry sector is a witness of several problems and many lethal diseases like infectious bursal disease virus (Makadiya *et al.*, 2006).

IBDV has great economic importance. The target organ of this disease is bursa of Fabricius which destroys B lymphocytes that leads to immunosuppression. Infectious bursal disease virus is very difficult to isolate, laboratory diagnosis is based on serological testing and molecular methods. The primary control of infectious bursal disease is vaccination. One of the major reasons of genetic drift of field viruses is the failure of vaccine that leads to the divergence of variant strains (Hamoud, 2006). Infectious bursal disease is the immunosuppressive disease of poultry that accompanied by high level of specific anti IBDV antibodies. Successful immunization required reliable vaccine and determination of vaccine performance is very important as to determine the antibody titer of the birds.
In this study VP2 region was selected since, it is variable region and provide genetic data regarding variability among stains and best evolutionary clue (Previn, 2009). This study was designed to develop an indirect ELISA kit using recombinant VP2 protein of infectious bursal disease virus. The purpose of study was to optimize the test conditions for i-ELISA, evaluation of vaccine performance and the determination of antibody titer using the developed ELISA kit. Virus was isolated form infected bursa samples and amplified by self-designed primers to get the bands. Primer set was used to amplify the partial VP2 region form 751bp – 1449bp to get the 699 bp product. Viral DNA was inserted and transformed in BL21 expression system and clone was confirmed through colony PCR. Protein was expressed by SDS-PAGE analysis. After purification of protein through affinity column this protein was coated on ELISA Plates. Different dilutions of protein and sera samples were used to optimize the test conditions for i-ELISA. 25x dilution containing 25µg/ml of protein were used for coating on ELISA plates with 100-time dilution of serum. For the evaluation of vaccine performance and to check the antibody titer, 50 birds were kept. At day 1 all the birds were vaccinated with Bursaplex vaccine with the dose rate of 0.2ml/bird subcutaneously. Sera samples were collected at day 3, 5, 7, 10, 14 and 21. Sera samples were checked for antibodies using the developed i-ELISA kit and mean values of antibody titer was recorded as 0.39, 1.56, 2.38, 2.99, 2.67, 2.32 and 1.47 respectively. Antibody titer was increasing from day 3 to day 7. It was found maximum at day 7 then start decreasing. A marked decrease in antibody titer was observed at day 21. This study concluded that VP2 was more immunogenic as compared to VP1, Vp3 and Vp4 region. VP2 is more suitable for coating as an antigen for the development of indirect ELISA as compared to other proteins and whole IBDV because it has advantage of having antigenic region which functions as neutralizing antibodies while VP3 and VP4 produce non-neutralizing antibodies. In hyper immune sera the polyclonal antibodies raised by VP2 are more immunogenic and suitable for detection hence, used for the development of indirect ELISA. This developed i-ELISA kit proved to be a cheap detection kit for the as compared to the commercially available kits for the detection of IBD in birds at farm level. Almost 96 samples can be tested in a single kit at a price of ten thousand approximately.

**Literature Cited**


Combating modern slavery and human trafficking: an examination of legal frameworks and enforcement mechanisms

Author: Dr. Nkem Ichoku-Adeleye
Birmingham City University, U.K

Abstract

It is of particular concern that despite slavery being abolished in international law with a clear international legal framework existing (ILO Conventions, Slavery Convention, Supplementary Convention and Palermo Protocol) which criminalises slave labour and human trafficking and imposes duties on state actors, these practices are condoned by both state and non-state actors. The world of sports for instance, is a lucrative industry generating a significant level of income which sometimes exceeds states’ GDP. The FIFA world cup is the biggest sporting event that oversees countries bidding to host. The benefits to a host country include, tourism, creation of jobs, accommodation and transport infrastructure. Qatar will be hosting the next world cup in 2022 and have come under intense scrutiny and criticism for abusive labour practices. Recording 185 Nepalese deaths in Qatar in 2013 while building world cup infrastructure, an estimation of the death of 4000 migrant workers before the launch of the word cup was made. FIFA’s mission to build a better future for all through football has been questioned while Qatar officials echoed the outrage stirred by media reports expressing shock at the deplorable conditions migrant workers have been subjected to. In collaboration with the International Labour Organisation (ILO), Qatar has agreed to oversee reform with enforcement mechanisms in place to ensure maximum protection for over 2 million migrant workers, with the ultimate aim of scrapping this exploitative system of sponsored labour. Although Qatar has duties under international law and has to report to the United Nations and the ILO, the question is whether oversight should be exercised over international sports organisations where main actors/stakeholders such FIFA are captured under this framework. FIFA have been prompted by media outlets to take action on these issues and to take an active stance against abusive labour practices. This paper is contributing to the ever increasing debate that in a globalised society, we need to move away from the state centric focus of international law and move towards global law that captures non state actors, creating binding obligations on them. With a growing discourse on the emergence of modern slavery and human trafficking on the political and legislative agenda, and with human trafficking estimated to generate billions in illicit proceeds, this discussion re-ignites the debate that activities of state and non-state actors need to fall within the ambit of international law in combatting modern slavery and human trafficking.

Male chauvinism in film Pinjir: A Semiotic Analysis

Author: Mr. Hamza Hassan
Lecturer, Department of English, NUML, Islamabad, Pakistan

Abstract: In South Asian literature, the term of male chauvinism can be traced extensively as Sub-continent is considered as a male dominant society. The film Pinjir which is based on a novel; is the representation of different cultures, creeds, religions and traditions reflecting the era before the partition of sub-continent. It enlightens many literary aspects and critical angles. This study revolves around this novel/film, focusing
male chauvinistic aspects. Semiotics as the study of signs, symbols, colours and language has been applied on this particular film as the major framework to trace all male chauvinistic aspects. The snaps of the movie with the same aspects can also be found in the Appendix at the end of the paper.

The Emirati burqa ‘An Intimate Object’ from a cultural, historical and contemporary art perspective

Author: Dr. Karima Alshomely
Assistant Professor, University of Sharjah-UAE

Abstract: The Emirati burqa or ‘mask’, a form of face covering worn by the majority of Emirati women in the United Arab Emirates until the late 1960s that reveals the eyes but does not cover the hair or body. ‘An Intimate Object’, that re-animates the burqa as a living object with its own history and new contemporary meanings. The burqa speaks, its indigo residue bleeds as an active witness to its lost past. It also plays a part in rediscovery or keeping the past of this material object alive through contemporary art practice as an aesthetic and political strategy.

In my art practice, I have experimented with traditional craft materials, inscription methods, film, photography and installation. My engagement is with performing the material culture of the female burqa as a response to its disappearing practice and its previously little recorded history. Focusing on the significance of the body and senses in knowledge production, the art practice shows the burqa has ‘a voice’ in a conversation that draws upon past traditions referencing protection and its value as a personal and precious object. the Emirati burqa on a substantial level that is hidden from the naked eyes. It is a dialogue between visual arts and significant heritage symbols, where the burqa is a visual text that authors the silent memoir of the face. It allows the onlookers a unique access to a world that highlights the daily life and rituals of the burqa owner. The artwork contains a detailed dark text on a lively blank surface, confronting the eyes that directly reflect the human soul. It displays the beliefs associated with the practice of burqa wearing and its rituals, especially the ones used in the past, some of which remain as they were, with the addition of modern adjustments.

Change Management Approaches for Overcoming ICT Project Resistance within a Firm

Author: Dr. Zakariya Chabani
Canadian University, Dubai, UAE

Abstract: Nowadays business use Information and Communication Technologies more often. Unfortunately, it often fails because too much attention is given to technical related features without taking into consideration a very important parameter “The user acceptance”. In this article, theoretical study and results on this matter are highlighted. For solving the “employees’ resistance” issue, a review for the most significant change management models has been done, in particularly the ICT change management models such as UTAT, TPB, DOI etc. in order to know what model is the best to be used by organizations.
The result of the study was that there is no best model in its absolute, but the models used by different companies can be used as benchmarking by other companies when their business area is similar. Moreover, since each company is developing its own change model, we conclude that it is necessary to prepare and establish a good ICT environment within the organization for a better ICT implementation.

Keywords: ICT, Change management, Change management models, Project development, Employees resistance.

Students’ Perspective on the use of WhatsApp to enhance English Language Learning

Authors: Nadia Hanif, Maria Sajid
University of Management & Technology, Pakistan

Abstract: Education system has advanced promptly and technology has started governing our educational system. All of us are active users of smart phones and the generation we teach is dependent on applications, such as WhatsApp, Facebook, Twitter and Instagram. These applications are widely used for attaining knowledge, asking questions and recovering information. Smart phones and their usage have eminent importance in educational field. This study aims at recognizing students’ perception towards using WhatsApp as a learning tool for English Language Learning at University of Management and Technology (UMT). Quantitative method is used in this study and data is collected by administering a questionnaire on 150 undergraduate students at UMT to investigate students’ perceptions regarding WhatsApp in learning English language. Results show that the practice of utilizing WhatsApp improves students’ learning both, in formal and informal situations. According to the students’ perception, one of the main advantages of using WhatsApp is that it is user friendly, free from classroom limitations, and it can be utilized to develop students’ communication and educational experience with respect to English language learning.

Problems faced by Women entrepreneurs in Designing Marketing strategy

Authors: Dr Pandit Mali and Gandhali Divekar
Indira Research Center, Savitribali Phule Pune University, India

Abstract: Economic progress and advancement of any nation are determined by matrix of availability & usage human, physical and financial resources. An economy can move on to higher levels of growth either by acquiring a larger quantum of the factors of production or through technical progress. The industrialisation is one of the ways of bringing about socio-economic development in any country which is facilitating the technological advancement. Th other supportive component to the economic development of a nation is its enterprising spirit. The characteristic of enterprising society emerges from the inter play of behaviour and activity of special segment of the population known as entrepreneurs. Entrepreneurs are the one who put all resources to use to get into creation of goods and services. They are the initiators of the process. India’s economy is today poised for a prospering entrepreneurial activity. It is also known that a healthy business environment is an essential requirement for entrepreneurial growth. Further women comprise of approximately 50% of the total population and important economic agent. Their participation
in the economy is extremely crucial. So, Entrepreneurship development among women is important for the achievement of broader development objectives such as growth with equity. Studies indicate that many women entrepreneurs are found working in difficult situations when compared to their male counterparts. Factors like political instability, poor infrastructure, high production costs and nonconducive business environment affect women entrepreneurs more than men. Limited access to key resources like land and credit, legal and socio-cultural environment also act as serious impediments. In the era of globalisation changing pattern of trade and evolving technologies necessitate skill enhancement that many entrepreneurs in the continent are yet to possess. This paper presents a brief view of the role of women entrepreneurs in the economic development and specifically focused on problems faced by women entrepreneurs in Designing marketing strategies.

The purpose of this research is to facilitate a discussion on how best to empower women with marketing skills in entrepreneurship ventures. This will in turn help in the marketing of entrepreneurship as a tool for the female empowerment and emancipation. It can be understood that women entrepreneurs have been making significant impact in all segments of the economy in the other developed countries like Canada, United Kingdom, Germany, Australia and the united states, etc. Hence role of women entrepreneurs is critical and crucial. Enabling them with required skillset will encourage their growth aspiration and prospects.

**Oz in Arabia: Language and Life Skills for Underprivileged Youth in Kuwait**

Author: Alison Larkin Koushki
American University, Kuwait